

**COLERAIN TOWNSHIP ZONING COMMISSION**

Regular Meeting

4200 Springdale Road - Cincinnati, OH 45251

**Tuesday, May 21, 2013 - 7:00 p.m.**

MEETING CALLED TO ORDER: 7:00 PM. PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE.

ROLL CALL: Present – Mr. Westfall, Mr. Lawson, Mrs. Smith, Mr. Grote

APPROVAL OF MINUTES: Motion by Mr. Grote to approve minutes of April 30, 2013 meeting. 2<sup>nd</sup> by Mrs. Smith. Motion carried.

PUBLIC ADDRESS: None.

FINAL DEVELOPMENT PLAN:

A. ZA2011-04 – Northgate Mall, hhgregg

Staff: Action request for approval of the final development plan for the hhgregg at Northgate Mall. The Zoning Commission held a special meeting on April 30 and approved a minor modification to the revised preliminary development plan for the Dillard's box and out lots that allowed for a new retail addition to be built on the north end of the Dillard's' box. hhgregg is proposing to relocate its store in this new retail space. During review of the preliminary development plan modification, addressed issues relating to pedestrian circulation, in particular the addition of a 5' curb sidewalk on the east front of the building (included in this final development plan), the requirement that there be no exterior dumpster storage because of the corridor view, (waste facility is now located inside building) Mrs. Smith discussed issues related to accessibility and those issues have been addressed on this final development plan. Since the preliminary development plan, the Applicant has proposed a treatment for landscaping (this is a very constrained site) and part of broader site which is all of the old Dillard's box building and out lots so much landscaping addressed already by the 5 other final development plans that have come before it (Cheddars, Longhorn, Dillard's McDonalds, Huntington) opportunities for new landscaping were minimal, but were able to get large landscape sidewalk planters included in site plan (schematic shown). The architectural design is in keeping with materials and styling of the new facade to the Dillard's' box building (talking about efface clad building), has parapet wall over customer entrance, has appropriate cornice treatment and facade offsets to give building visual interest and from an architectural design perspective this meets all architectural standards. Signage proposed in FDP is in keeping with all junior anchor tenants along the old Dillard's building, signage proposed at 150' wall signage for the north and east elevation sites. Other issue in preliminary development plan was whether or not the facade would be continuous or whether the building would be attached or detached and from the public's perspective, this is a continuous space with no way to get into any space that would exist between the Dillard's building and the proposed hhgregg. In looking at requirements in Zoning Resolution related to the approval criteria for a FDP, it meets all dimensional requirements, from the landscaping perspective it tries hard with landscaping, and regardless the site looks good now and will look better as streetscape get built out, signage plan is in keeping with every other project on the site, exterior lighting not changed, streetscape plan does not changed, architectural design matches the style and materials of the new facade of the Dillard's building, and in keeping with Zoning Resolution pedestrian circulation plan was addressed with the 5' sidewalk. Staff recommendation approval with the following conditions: no additional signage permitted on the building, any new lighting comply with the design standards found in section 12.9 of the Zoning Resolution and that any modification to this final

development plan be submitted to Colerain Township as a major minor modification to the final development plan.

Applicant: Jeff Osterman, Phoenix Architecture, 9475 Kenwood Road replied to Mr. Westfall's comments that the breezy way will be closed and the standard connections between roofs will drain to roof drains and be taken properly according to building codes. That area will not be open, will touch and be sealed water tight.

Zoning Commission: None.

Commission Action: Motion by Mr. Grote to approve Final Development Plan ZA2011-04 Northgate Mall hhgregg Development as has been presented to the Committee with the conditions as listed by Staff: no additional signage permitted on the building, any new lighting comply with the design standards found in section 12.9 of the Zoning Resolution and that any modification to this final development plan be submitted to Colerain Township as a major minor modification to the final development plan. 2<sup>nd</sup> by Mr. Westfall.

Roll Call: All members voted in favor.

**PUBLIC HEARING:**

A.	Case No.	ZA2005-0003 – Major Amendment to FDP, Buffalo Wild Wings
	Location:	Stone Creek Towne Center
	Applicant/Owner:	SCB Land Company LLC
	Request:	Change use from office to restaurant and retail with revisions to building and parking configurations.

Staff: Action being asked for approval of a major modification to a final development plan for an out lot at Stone Creek Town Center, located immediately behind Toys R Us, applicant SCB Land Company, LLC. History given: in September 2005 fdp approved for entire stone creek town center development; programed for use as a 3 story bank office. To modify current use, a major modification is needed. Submitted to Regional planning and RPC recommended unanimous approval. New 2013 proposal shows on west side of site a Buffalo Wild Wing Restaurant and east side of site called the Shops at Stone Creek, a 3 unit retail restaurant development. Two entrances off the main road and an excellent landscape plan by Craig Gosman of MKSK created a very accessible rhythm to streetscape with a series of stone piers themes, with the theme used in monument signage referencing all the stone throughout the Stone Creek development. Zoning Code requires that 15% of parking area be landscaped and to meet parking of the tenants, Staff worked with applicant and landscape architect to beef up the edge landscaping treatment at the expense of some of the interior landscaping and ended up with a very well thought out landscaping plan. Elevations shown of both buildings and Buffalo Wild Wings proposed their new architectural concept, which deviates from their standard and added a stone water table per request from Township. The rendering of the Shops at Stone Creek does not meet some of the basic architectural design standards and the Zoning Resolution calls for a more pronounced cornice treatment than a 6" coping sitting on top of building, the roof line does not stray from flat and do require roof line changes and parapet walls to give architectural interest. Recommend the Zoning Commissioners condition approval on a rethinking of the architecture of this building. As a discussion, the dimensional requirements, building locations, land uses, densities, intensities, yard requirements, areas and frontage requirements are all consistent with revised preliminary development plan, the land use plan and comprehensive plan. The landscape plan, while it does not meet the requirement of 15% quantity figure, has gone above and beyond as far as quality. A very modest signage request for

the development has been requested. Buffalo Wild Wings is requesting 51% sq. ft. of wall signage and 21 sq. ft. of monument signage. The height of the monument sign pier is 5' and the sign measurement of 3'x6'. The Shops of Stone Creek are requesting 1 sq. ft. per linear foot of building frontage which is consistent with keeping with ordinance (104 sq. ft. wall signage on three signs and an identical monument sign 21 sq. ft.). Exterior lighting plan – as addressed in Zoning Ordinance, says average height no higher than 2' candles and the average came in 2.1', which we could accept. Streetscape plan was thoughtful and attractive in keeping with high design quality of the development. The Shops in Stone creek could be beefed up a bit. Staff recommends approval of this amendment to major modification to FDP with 5 conditions: 1. no additional signage be permitted; 2. any new lighting should comply with design standards of Zoning Resolution Section 12.9; 3. any modifications to FDP be submitted as Twp. major minor modification to preliminary development plan; 4. all deciduous trees be 2 ½" in caliber at planting and evergreens should be 6' high; 5. The Shops of Stonecreek building be modified to include roofline changes, cornice treatments and parapet walls as in accordance to Section 12.11 of Zoning Resolution. This plan will include three modifications to design standards which Staff supports: 1. use of 9x16.5 approved parking stalls rather than of 9x18 stalls as required in Zoning Ordinance; 2. average illumination be permitted to be 2.1 ft. candles; and 3. parking area landscaping be permitted as indicated on landscaping plan.

Applicant: Mike Brandy, 45 Fairfield Ave Belleview Ky. Worked with Township Staff on landscape and is in agreement with everything except the building, which was compatible to the current design structure and not a clone. Mr. Lawson and Mr. Westfall commented the Zoning Commission would like to see a clone (referencing the restaurant/retail building). Developer will work with Staff on remodeling to more clone like, ensuring the rules in zoning ordinance are met.

In response to inquiries of the Commission, the following was reported: Mr. Brandy said there are no current rentals, but in negotiations with compatible businesses. He suspects the BWW south on Colerain is relocating, but not certain. The design of separate buildings vs. a Bridgewater Falls type Development was more aesthetically appealing for this development and a more universal parking plan to marry tenants. If additional buildings would be considered for this property, a major modification to the final development plan would be required. Mr. Huber, site civil engineer with Abercrombie & Associates, explained the development will not impact the creek that separates the restaurants with drainage or runoff. Staff commented that previous comment was for personal service usage potential. That could be spa type usage.

Motion to Open

Public Input: Motion by Mr. Westfall. 2<sup>nd</sup> by Ms. Smith. Motion carried.

Motion to Close

Public Input: Motion by Mr. Lawson to close public hearing. 2<sup>nd</sup> by Mr. Grote. Motion carried.

Zoning Commission: None.

Commission Action: Motion by Mr. Grote to approve case ZA2005-003, major amendments to the final development plan of Stone Creek Town Center, for the building of the BWW wild wings and separate building for three additional tenants, conditioned upon the conditions and modifications as reviewed by us as presented by staff that become matter of minutes of meeting this evening. 2<sup>nd</sup> by Mr. Westfall.

Roll Call: All members voted in favor.

The applicant will now meet with the Board of Trustees for public hearing for a major modification. After Trustee meeting applicant will go to Zoning for Zoning Certificate

INFORMAL CONCEPT REVIEW:

A. 8940 Colerain, Northgate Ford – R-6 to B-2 to allow parking of new vehicles.

Staff: Action tonight is an informal concept plan review / a voluntary step in a zone change process. Applicant was not in attendance, proposes to install a 270' by 140' parking to store cars, to extend from existing B2 lot into a R6 residential district which does not permit parking lots. The current zoning is B2 up to rear portion of property, 40' past the existing lot and border is heavily wooded. A few suggestions by Staff so as not to spot zone and stay within the comprehensive plan: that if considering a zone change, that the applicant consider extending to the north of the site to incorporate the current non-conforming use of the Moose Lodge (R6); when a B2 is adjacent to a R6, the zoning ordinance requires a 40' vegetative buffer; another factor in the decision is the Comp plan talks quite a bit about preserving the boundary between B2 and residential district in the Colerain corridor – came up on this with Joseph parking lot, and will run up against it if church on Poole Rd wants to do day care, sort of commercial and higher intensity intrusions into a residential district and the comprehensive plan says to avoid those BUT this is an example where a parking lot is buffered by 50f of woods on each side and this is an interesting situation. The applicant does meet this buffering rule with this proposal.

Applicant: None.

Zoning Commission: Suggested including the non-conforming Moose property in the proposal. Staff is only giving report and not recommendation and explained that the applicant initially came for a zoning certificate of the shaded area and was denied. If the applicant moves forward it would be suggested to possibly include the entire section for consideration. The Zoning Ordinance is a tool to get a desired outcome in land use and if desired outcome is for the area to be residential which zoning ordinance says, then appropriate. If not forcing to be residential, then it is appropriate to look at B2 classification. The wooded area to the southwest is a neighborhood and to the south the Furniture fair business (with less than required setbacks as done prior to Twp. zoning) and Staff not sure how affected the residents would be - residents would prefer much space as possible. With this proposal, one parking lot, it is buffered with dense trees and foliage and would be hard to imagine a situation where there would be whole lot of noise, light and exhaust coming off this site. The Commission is not in agreement with zoning creeping and changing of buffers and mentioned previous discussion on the expansion of the parking lots related to the land bank properties and why those homes had decayed. Not opposed to a reclassification of zoning but possibly going to the BZA to ask for extension of concrete on the property below the development to the south and allow it to be an extension of current concrete. Staff explained the use is not permitted in this district and they would need to get a use variance and that is very difficult, especially moving across parcels. Staff will share comments with applicant should they call. This project fits into the design of Colerain Avenue, to get parcels larger for future development that larger lots are available to eliminate the small box.

OLD BUSINESS: None.


NEW BUSINESS: None.


ADMINISTRATION: None.

ANNOUNCEMENTS: Mr. Westfall asked that everyone please pray for those in Oklahoma.

NEXT MEETING: June 18, 2013.

ADJOURNMENT: Motion to adjourn by Mr. Westfall at 8:00 p.m. 2<sup>nd</sup> by Mrs. Smith.  
Motion carried.

  
\_\_\_\_\_  
Respectfully submitted:  
Tina Burns, Staff Secretary

  
\_\_\_\_\_  
Accepted:  
Christopher R. Lawson, Chairman

