
Ashland City Council

MINUTES FOR THE REGULAR SESSION OF COUNCIL December 19, 2006

Council President Glen Stewart called the meeting to order at 7:00 p.m.

ROLL CALL

Ward 1:	Robert L. Valentine	Present
Ward 2:	Robert M. Valentine	Present
Ward 3:	Ruth Detrow	Present
Ward 4:	Paul Wertz	Present
At-large:	Glen Stewart	Present

Note: Throughout the minutes, Robert L. Valentine and Robert M. Valentine are designated as to their ward representation, W1 and W2.

PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE

PRESENTATION OF MINUTES

December 5, 2006 *Regular session*

Moved by Detrow and seconded by Valentine W1 to approve the minutes as received.

Ayes: Valentine W2, Detrow, Wertz, Stewart, Valentine W1

COMMENTS OR QUESTIONS FROM THE AUDIENCE: None

LEGISLATION

Ord. 95-06

Item (a) AN ORDINANCE ESTABLISHING NEW RATES FOR THE PARKS AND RECREATION DEPARTMENT FOR THE CITY OF ASHLAND.

Moved by Wertz and seconded by Detrow to invoke Section 113.01 of the Codified Ordinances as the distribution of this Ordinance has satisfied the requirements of said Section and that a further reading be dispensed with at this time.

Ayes: Valentine W2, Detrow, Wertz, Stewart, Valentine W1

Comments:

Director of Parks and Recreation Tim Clingan explained that this ordinance would allow the setting of new fees for the Parks and Recreation Department. The increases are mainly for the golf course. For several years, the golf course has increased its rates every other year by \$0.50 for nine holes and \$1.00 for eighteen holes, trying to keep up with their expenses and to stay competitive with area courses. The fees have increased for carts if used, and also for balls used at the driving range; the last increase for this was 10 years ago.

Additional revenue to be generated by this: \$16,500 for greens fees; \$8,200 for carts; a little over \$4,000 for the driving range; with a total of about \$28,725. The golf course is in need of this additional revenue; after looking at their financial position with the Finance Department, they are projecting somewhat of an overage on expenditures as of December 31st, of a little over \$18,000.

Stewart asked if the number of rounds played are starting to go down, and Clingan responded no, giving the example of this November, 21,289; November 2005, 21,151, up about 138. Clingan stated they have pretty much reached a plateau as to rounds, of which they try to get about 22,000, and they have for the last few years.

Stewart noted his golf-playing friends say they can go to other courses for about \$2.00 to \$5.00 less (usually special rates of some kind or another), and they take issue with that. He asked Clingan to comment on this. Clingan responded that other courses do have specials, but Ashland also offers specials to get golfers there. He outlined some of those and how much the players will save on them.

Valentine W1 asked about information from other courses, which Clingan did not have as it is mostly confidential. Valentine W1 asked about the figures being from the actual season and when the season is, and Clingan confirmed that and explained that the season begins around the end of March and goes through the end of September, depending on the weather, of course. Non-season rates are lower, and he emphasized that Ashland is one of the few courses that stay open year round, and by so doing, pick up quite a few rounds from surrounding counties even.

Valentine W1 asked about the donation of canned goods for reduced cost play in November/December times, to which Clingan responded that they have been doing that for about 15 years, and it is very successful. Some people and employees just bring in canned goods to them anyway, making the Park's donation larger.

Wertz questioned morning specials that other courses offer (Nova course) and how can Ashland compete without having morning special rates, by which more rounds would be played in mornings? Clingan told him they could try. That course (Nova) is not making any money on that and neither would Ashland. Ashland is already losing money, and cutting rates would just cause more subsidizing. Wertz stated that at least there would be some money coming in if players were on the course. Clingan said that that is true.

Detrow asked if there were more specials that could be used to be more competitive, and she also commented that in talking to golfing enthusiast friends, she had been told that many think the City's golf rates are fair. Clingan explained that the rates are reduced as conditions dictate, so perhaps they could try the morning rates.

He emphasized that they are doing many \$5.00 off coupon specials, listing one of them and detailing the revenue gained versus costs to the course: 232 coupons used; revenue was \$5,169; discount amount \$1,651; advertising cost \$1,850; netting the course \$1,668. Clingan emphasized that the course was not subsidized to the degree this year that they have been in some other years.

Valentine W1 asked about the youth programs scheduled on Mondays and Fridays, and Clingan told him that there are other sports activities that the kids are in on Tuesdays, Wednesdays and Thursdays. Most other courses aren't normally as busy on Mondays and Fridays, so the youth programs have established themselves on those days. Valentine W1 added that he was sure that anyone going out there when all those kids are on the course would be discouraged. Clingan said he has already gotten those comments; it does discourage them. He repeated that normally those two days are off days on most courses.

Stewart suggested that might be a good time to offer an enticement to play at a good rate even though the kids are there; if the kids are a discouragement, maybe that would be a good time for a special. Dollars speak, at least to a lot of people.

Valentine W1 said the idea is to get more people to play more rounds. He went on to say that he thinks from looking at the ordinance, Ashland does seem to be competitive with other courses. Clingan indicated that when the other courses set their rates, he would try to get those to compare to see where the City stands; he will get that information to Council. The difficulty is that the specials fall on different times on different courses, making it harder to compete.

Detrow noted that when she was checking on this, she was assured that everybody is going to raise rates this year due to it being more costly to keep courses in good shape. Clingan agreed with the fact that many costs are going up, from gasoline to petroleum-based chemicals and other needs.

Moved by Detrow and seconded by Valentine W1 that the Ordinance be passed on the first reading.

Ayes: Valentine W2, Detrow, Wertz, Stewart, Valentine W1

Moved by Wertz and seconded by Detrow that the rules requiring the reading on three separate days be suspended and that the Ordinance be passed on the second and third readings.

Ayes: Valentine W2, Detrow, Wertz, Stewart, Valentine W1

Moved by Stewart and seconded by Valentine W2 that the Ordinance be passed.

Ayes: Valentine W2, Detrow, Wertz, Stewart, Valentine W1

Motion carried.

Ord. 96-06

Item (b) AN ORDINANCE AMENDING ORDINANCE 91-06 AUTHORIZING AND DIRECTING THE MAYOR TO ENTER INTO A CONTRACT FOR THE PURCHASE OF EQUIPMENT FOR THE DIVISION OF FIRE OF THE CITY OF ASHLAND, OHIO, OBVIATING FORMAL ADVERTISING AND BIDDING; AND DECLARING AN EMERGENCY

Moved by Wertz and seconded by Detrow to invoke Section 113.01 of the Codified Ordinances as the distribution of this Ordinance has satisfied the requirements of said Section and that a further reading be dispensed with at this time.

Ayes: Valentine W2, Detrow, Wertz, Stewart, Valentine W1

Comments:

Finance Director Anna Tomasek explained that this ordinance amends Ordinance No. 91-06 due to the increase of the price of the rescue squad. The original estimate was \$105,000, but the actual cost of the vehicle is going to be \$108,207.

Valentine W1 noted a rebate discount in the information sent with the ordinance and asked if it would be used? Tomasek said that was correct; however, the check has to be issued for \$108,207 to the state. Once the vehicle is received, then the rebate will be issued.

Valentine W1 wanted to know if the rebate was anticipated before the price went up, and Tomasek said finance had no knowledge of that. Valentine W1 stated that with the rebate it is less than the original.

Valentine W2 asked about the insurance payment on the totaled squad and if it would go on to help with the cost of the new one; Tomasek said it would, and the value of the vehicle and the insurance payment is \$7,000.

Moved by Wertz and seconded by Valentine W1 that the Ordinance be passed on the first reading.

Ayes: Valentine W2, Detrow, Wertz, Stewart, Valentine W1

Moved by Wertz and seconded by Detrow that the rules requiring the reading on three separate days be suspended and that the Ordinance be passed on the second and third readings.

Ayes: Valentine W2, Detrow, Wertz, Stewart, Valentine W1

Moved by Valentine W2 and seconded by Valentine W1 that the Ordinance be passed.

Ayes: Valentine W2, Detrow, Wertz, Stewart, Valentine W1

Motion carried.

Ord. 97-06

Item (c) AN ORDINANCE AUTHORIZING AND DIRECTING THE MAYOR, DIRECTOR OF PUBLIC SERVICE, TO ENTER INTO A MODIFICATION OF THE ASHLAND WASTE WATER TREATMENT PLANT EQUALIZATION BASIN PROJECT – BOGNER CONSTRUCTION COMPANY CONTRACT AUTHORIZED BY ORDINANCE NO. 30-06; AND DECLARING AN EMERGENCY.

Moved by Valentine W2 and seconded by Detrow to invoke Section 113.01 of the Codified Ordinances as the distribution of this Ordinance has satisfied the requirements of said Section and that a further reading be dispensed with at this time.

Ayes: Valentine W2, Detrow, Wertz, Stewart, Valentine W1

Comments:

City Engineer Jim Cooper explained to Council that this modification basically is a summation of all the efforts and changes to the contract over the year and a half of construction. There is a list with the ordinance that breaks the costs down. It does sound like a lot of money and it is a lot of money, but this has been a five million dollar project, so this is less than 1%, which Cooper thinks is quite good. This is the final change order. The equalization basin is done.

Stewart told Council that they are invited to come out about one hour after a major storm, at which time they can see the equalization basin at its finest moment, working.

Moved by Valentine W1 and seconded by Valentine W2 that the Ordinance be passed on the first reading.

Ayes: Valentine W2, Detrow, Wertz, Stewart, Valentine W1

Moved by Wertz and seconded by Detrow that the rules requiring the reading on three separate days be suspended and that the Ordinance be passed on the second and third readings.

Ayes: Valentine W2, Detrow, Wertz, Stewart, Valentine W1

Moved by Detrow and seconded by Valentine W1 that the Ordinance be passed.

Ayes: Valentine W2, Detrow, Wertz, Stewart, Valentine W1

Motion carried.

Item (d) AN ORDINANCE AMENDING ORDINANCE 11-06, ORDINANCE 40-06 AND ORDINANCE 88-06 BY CREATING ADDITIONAL APPROPRIATIONS FOR THE YEAR 2006 AND DECLARING AN EMERGENCY MEASURE NECESSARY TO MEET THE FINANCIAL NEEDS OF THE CITY OF ASHLAND, OHIO.

Comments:

Mayor Strine requested that this item be removed from the agenda, as it is not complete at this time.

EXECUTIVE SESSION

Stewart requested an executive session be held immediately for matters relating to personnel issues of wages and benefits of public employees. Council will return to regular session at the end of the executive session.

Moved by Valentine W2 and seconded by Valentine W1 to move to executive session.

Ayes: Valentine W2, Detrow, Wertz, Stewart, Valentine W1

Council moved to executive session at 7:28 p.m. and returned at 7:45 p.m.

Moved by Wertz and seconded by Detrow to reconvene the regular session.

Ayes: Valentine W2, Detrow, Wertz, Stewart, Valentine W1

Ord. 98-06

Item (e) AN ORDINANCE ESTABLISHING WAGES AND OTHER COMPENSATIONS FOR ADMINISTRATIVE EMPLOYEES, EXEMPTED FROM THE FAIR LABOR STANDARDS ACT, OF THE CITY OF ASHLAND, OHIO; AND DECLARING AN EMERGENCY.

Moved by Wertz and seconded by Valentine W1 to invoke Section 113.01 of the Codified Ordinances as the distribution of this Ordinance has satisfied the requirements of said Section and that a further reading be dispensed with at this time.

Ayes: Valentine W2, Detrow, Wertz, Stewart, Valentine W1

Comments:

Mayor Strine commented that this ordinance provides a 3% increase effective the first of the year for those employees described in the preamble.

Moved by Valentine W2 and seconded by Valentine W1 that the Ordinance be passed on the first reading.

Ayes: Valentine W2, Detrow, Wertz, Stewart, Valentine W1

Moved by Wertz and seconded by Detrow that the rules requiring the reading on three separate days be suspended and that the Ordinance be passed on the second and third readings.

Ayes: Valentine W2, Detrow, Wertz, Stewart, Valentine W1

Moved by Detrow and seconded by Valentine W1 that the Ordinance be passed.

Ayes: Valentine W2, Detrow, Wertz, Stewart, Valentine W1

Motion carried.

Ord. 99-06

Item (f) AN ORDINANCE ESTABLISHING NEW LIMITS FOR WAGES AND DETERMINING OTHER PROVISIONS RELATIVE TO POSITIONS OF EMPLOYMENT OF SUPERVISORY PERSONNEL FOR AREAS NOT INCLUDED IN ANOTHER WAGE OR SALARY ORDINANCE IN THE CITY OF ASHLAND, OHIO; AND DECLARING AN EMERGENCY.

Moved by Wertz and seconded by Valentine W2 to invoke Section 113.01 of the Codified Ordinances as the distribution of this Ordinance has satisfied the requirements of said Section and that a further reading be dispensed with at this time.

Ayes: Valentine W2, Detrow, Wertz, Stewart, Valentine W1

Comments:

The Mayor noted the same 3% increase at the beginning of the year for the supervisory employees.

Moved by Wertz and seconded by Valentine W1 that the Ordinance be passed on the first reading.

Ayes: Valentine W2, Detrow, Wertz, Stewart, Valentine W1

Moved by Wertz and seconded by Detrow that the rules requiring the reading on three separate days be suspended and that the Ordinance be passed on the second and third readings.

Ayes: Valentine W2, Detrow, Wertz, Stewart, Valentine W1

Moved by Wertz and seconded by Detrow that the Ordinance be passed.

Ayes: Valentine W2, Detrow, Wertz, Stewart, Valentine W1

Motion carried.

Ord. 100-06

Item (g) AN ORDINANCE ESTABLISHING NEW LIMITS FOR WAGES AND DETERMINING OTHER PROVISIONS RELATIVE TO POSITIONS OF EMPLOYMENT OF FIDUCIARY PERSONNEL TO DIVISION DIRECTORS AND ELECTED OFFICIALS IN THE CITY OF ASHLAND, OHIO; AND DECLARING AN EMERGENCY.

Moved by Wertz and seconded by Detrow to invoke Section 113.01 of the Codified Ordinances as the distribution of this Ordinance has satisfied the requirements of said Section and that a further reading be dispensed with at this time.

Ayes: Valentine W2, Detrow, Wertz, Stewart, Valentine W1

Comments:

Mayor Strine explained that this ordinance also provides 3% to the fiduciary personnel, who are the assistants and secretaries to the division directors and various offices.

From the audience, Dennis Kitchen asked if any in these last ordinances were involved in the wage freeze, and Stewart told him they all were. Kitchen explained that he'd heard that some people in this classification haven't had a raise in two years. Stewart stated that is not true.

Tomasek told Kitchen that last year they received 4%, and the year before that the wages were frozen.

Mayor Strine told Kitchen that there are many places that haven't had pay raises for four, five or six years. Kitchen said he understands that, but he wanted to know how the 3% was figured. The Mayor responded that that amount is what the City can afford at this time. Kitchen thanked the Mayor and stated that that answers his question.

Moved by Valentine W2 and seconded by Detrow that the Ordinance be passed on the first reading.

Ayes: Valentine W2, Detrow, Wertz, Stewart, Valentine W1

Moved by Wertz and seconded by Valentine W1 that the rules requiring the reading on three separate days be suspended and that the Ordinance be passed on the second and third readings.

Ayes: Valentine W2, Detrow, Wertz, Stewart, Valentine W1

Moved by Wertz and seconded by Valentine W2 that the Ordinance be passed.

Ayes: Valentine W2, Detrow, Wertz, Stewart, Valentine W1

Motion carried.

Ord. 101-06

Item (h) AN ORDINANCE ESTABLISHING NEW LIMITS FOR WAGES AND DETERMINING OTHER PROVISIONS RELATIVE TO POSITIONS OF EMPLOYMENT OF ALL OTHER PERSONNEL FOR AREAS NOT INCLUDED IN ANOTHER WAGE OR SALARY ORDINANCE IN THE CITY OF ASHLAND, OHIO; AND DECLARING AN EMERGENCY.

Moved by Wertz and seconded by Stewart to invoke Section 113.01 of the Codified Ordinances as the distribution of this Ordinance has satisfied the requirements of said Section and that a further reading be dispensed with at this time.

Ayes: Valentine W2, Detrow, Wertz, Stewart, Valentine W1

Comments:

Mayor Strine stated that this ordinance also provides 3% for the other employees listed in this ordinance.

Moved by Valentine W1 and seconded by Valentine W2 that the Ordinance be passed on the first reading.

Ayes: Valentine W2, Detrow, Wertz, Stewart, Valentine W1

Moved by Wertz and seconded by Detrow that the rules requiring the reading on three separate days be suspended and that the Ordinance be passed on the second and third readings.

Ayes: Valentine W2, Detrow, Wertz, Stewart, Valentine W1

Moved by Valentine W1 and seconded by Valentine W2 that the Ordinance be passed.

Ayes: Valentine W2, Detrow, Wertz, Stewart, Valentine W1

Motion carried.

WARD REPORTS

Ward 1: Bob Valentine

(a) *Appreciation:*

Valentine W1 complimented the Street Department and Jerry Mack for helping remedy a situation at a condo association and thanked them.

Ward 2: Bob Valentine

(a) *Stop sign, Fourth Street:*

Valentine W2 asked why the Traffic Committee decided to put up stop signs on Fourth Street, and Mayor Strine told him there were safety issues there, as far as people crossing there from the Pumphouse and from the various services at the County Building. Vehicles were go-

ing too fast down that street, and with the various issues it was decided it would be safer with the stop signs.

Valentine W2 indicated he had driven to work that way for 28 years, and the disservice was that on the first day, he ran it. The Mayor responded that they had talked about that, and he thought there were to be warning signs put up by the school. Street Director Jerry Mack explained that warning signs were put up and positioned as best they could for seeing them.

Valentine W2 asked if there had been a notice in the paper? The Mayor responded that there probably wasn't, but would that have helped? Valentine W2 said it would have helped him; he reads the paper!

Ward 3: Ruth Detrow

(a) *Sidewalk and street marking questions:*

Detrow expressed her appreciation to the Traffic Committee for the letter to Steve Kline, who was unhappy about the lack of lines on his street, Lincoln Avenue. He also had asked about when the sidewalk program would get to his area.

OLD BUSINESS

(a) *Appointment of 2007 Charter Revision Commission:*

Stewart told Council there was now a total of 19 names available for the Charter Review Committee; names were submitted through volunteers, suggestions and recommendations. A letter will go out to these people telling them that their acceptance will generate a pool of people from which a group of ten would be derived to serve on the committee. The letter will request either an acceptance or a declination to serve from each one by January 9th. The letter will also recommend that questions be directed to Council members. Stewart emphasized that they would like to have a nice cross-section of the community participate in this Charter Review Committee, which might have suggestions that could potentially go to the November election, if everything is timely done.

NEW BUSINESS

(a) *Special session of Council, December 29, 2006:*

Stewart explained that there is a pretty heavy agenda for the special meeting. If it is not on the agenda as of today, Council would prefer that no additional items go on the agenda since it is a special meeting. There are three public hearings and legislation for each, plus the financial wrap-ups, which will have to be read, taking extra time.

It's a full agenda, and Stewart indicated he preferred that it not be added to unless it was something that couldn't wait a few days till January 2nd.

(b) *Executive session cancelled:*

Stewart stated that the executive session scheduled and on the agenda and pertaining to imminent litigation would not be held. There is nothing to discuss at this time.

MAYOR'S COMMENTS: *None*

ADJOURNMENT

Moved by Valentine W1 and seconded by Valentine W1 to adjourn.

Ayes: Valentine W2, Detrow, Wertz, Stewart, Valentine W1

Council adjourned the regular session at 8:03 p.m.

Submitted by
Elaine C. Hootman
Clerk of Council